

supernatural beings or otherworldly dimensions; and ordinary, everyday, mortal entertainers depicted in the literature. A short discussion of the *aes dano*, a privileged somewhat sacred group in medieval Irish society, is also provided in this section.

In the chapter on "Instruments," the author discusses the appearance of various instruments in the literature, as well as any and all supernatural or otherworldly dimensions associated with or illustrated in the literature. These instruments include the *crott* or *cruitt* (harp), the *timpan*, the fiddle, the bagpipes, pipes and whistles, trumpets and horns, bells, *cnamfir*, *fer-cengail*, and the musical branch. After discussing each of these instruments, the author then examines them in three main categories: instruments in a purely Otherworld context; instruments in everyday life, yet with some otherworldly influence(s); and instruments in everyday life with no otherworldly influences.

In the chapter on "Effects," two main areas are discussed: the supernatural or otherworld effects of music; and the effects of music in everyday, mundane life. Both the pagan and Christian contexts of music in medieval Irish society and otherworld situations are examined. An explanation of the three strains of music (*suantraigi*, *genntraig*, and *golltraigi*) is given, and examples of their appearance in the literature is provided. The author has found over twenty-five different types of effects of music in the literature, which I found very interesting.

In the chapters on "Places" and "Times," there are three main subdivisions of materials: places where music is described as part of a purely supernatural otherworld dimension; places which are liminal (everyday places that are natural symbols of transcendence); and everyday places where music is heard.

In the Conclusion, the author once again reiterates chapter by chapter the results of her research. There are ten charts given in the Appendix, which also document graphically the groupings and subdivisions of otherworldly music in medieval Celtic literature. Finally, an extensive bibliography of sources is provided.

While I found the information in this book both interesting and fascinating, I was somewhat concerned by the constant reiteration by the author of her findings, as well as the constant reiteration of examples from the literature in different chapters. The reader is constantly having summaries of the research given by the author: first in the chapters, then in the conclusions of the chapters, and finally in the Conclusion of the book. I almost felt like a child being given a constant reminder from my parents, or that there really wasn't all that much information to give and that the author was trying to fill up space. In any event, this book does bring together a useful survey of medieval Celtic literature and the appearances of music in medieval Celtic literature related to the otherworld and the spiritual.

***The Otherworld Voyage in Early Irish Literature. An Anthology of Criticism*, Jonathan M. Wooding Editor, Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2000, xxviii + 290 pages. ISBN 1-85182-2461. Hardback. IEP 35,-**

Reviewed by [David Stifter](#), Institut für Sprachwissenschaft (Indogermanistik), Vienna, Austria

The fact that at the recently held 11th International Congress of Celtic Studies (Cork 1999) four papers alone were dedicated to the *Nauigatio Sancti Brendani* 'The Voyage of Saint Brendan' (henceforth NSB), gives ample evidence of the interest in this fascinating Middle Latin text, as well as in the genre of early Irish voyage literature, of which NSB is a part, as a whole. But despite this interest scholarship in the field has been largely hampered by the unsatisfying accessibility of a good deal of the secondary literature. To remedy the lack of a critical study encompassing all aspects of the genre, at the occasion of a conference in Maynooth (June 1995) the idea was born to put together a guide to these tales and their background with representative selections of seminal studies, spanning nearly a century of scholarly work. The result is the volume *The Otherworld Voyage in Early Irish Literature*, edited by Jonathan Wooding, lecturer at the University of Wales, Lampeter and himself a specialist in the field for many years.

In the Introduction (pp. x-xxviii) Wooding gives a survey of the history of scholarship, what the beginnings of the voyage tales may have been and what contributed to the voyage tales in their formation into a genre in its own right in Irish literature. This is followed by a concise sketch of the tales' literary criticism. A list of the voyage tales, editions and translations sums up the introduction. As to Michaela Zelzer's new edition of NSB, mentioned on page xxv, I can now report that it is planned to appear in 2002 (pers. comm.).

All articles in this volume have been re-set. The original page count is not indicated. At times the re-setting has been done too carelessly. In the original of James Carney's 'The Earliest Bran Material' (1976) italicised letters were used for the diplomatic edition of the Old Irish text *Imbaccaldam* on page 178 ff.; in the present volume everything has been reset in plain letters (pp. 77 ff.). As a consequence a good deal of the expansions and abbreviations is no longer recognisable as such. Most annoying to a scholar of Irish is the silent omission of the punctum delens over lenited f and s. The last word of stanza 3 on page 181 of the original reads *máfríth* [punctum delens over the f]; an r has been forgotten in *máfríth* in the process of re-setting (p. 79). The original article will still have to be consulted for quotations.

The editor decided only to include items in English, depriving himself of the opportunity to reprint important contributions like Carl Selmer's '*Die Herkunft und Frühgeschichte der Navigatio Sancti Brendani*' (1956). Though understandable in view of a readership primarily intended to be of English mothertongue, it seems that this self-restriction also induced the compilers of the bibliography (pp. 255-271) to the sloppiness of passing over a couple of non-English studies, which undoubtedly would have merited mentioning there: for example Paul Grosjean's (*Analecta Bollandiana* 78, 1960, 454-459) and Paul Tombeur's (*Revue Belge de Philologie et d'Histoire* 39, 1961, 1040-1042) reviews of Selmer's edition of NSB; or Gabriele Socher's (1990) philological thesis *Textkritische und sprachliche Untersuchungen zur Navigatio Sancti Brendani unter Berücksichtigung dreier Wiener Handschriften*, Wien.

The re-printed articles are chronologically ordered, starting with Charles Plummer's 'Some New Light on the Brendan Legend' of the year 1905 (pp. 1-14). A series of articles examines the historical, theological and legal background of medieval Irish seafaring: William Flint Thrall 'Clerical Sea Pilgrimages and the *Imrama*' (pp. 15-21); Mary E. Byrne 'On the Punishment of Sending Adrift' (pp. 22-26); and more recently Thomas Charles-Edwards 'The Social Background to Irish *Peregrinatio*' (pp. 94-108).

A large portion of the book is devoted to the motives of the voyage tales and their literary interrelations with each other and with other texts. Mario Esposito identified 'An Apocryphal »*Book of Enoch and Elias*« as a Possible Source of the *Navigatio sancti Brendani*' (pp. 27-41), Ludwig Bieler contributed 'Two Observations Concerning the *Navigatio Brendani*' (pp. 91-93). Colin A. Ireland draws attention to 'Some Analogues of the Old English Seafarer from Hiberno-Latin Sources' (pp. 143-156). Other articles are John Carey's 'The Location of the Otherworld in Irish Tradition' (pp. 113-119) and 'Ireland and the Antipodes: The Heterodoxy of Virgil of Salzburg' (pp. 133-142), and Dorothy Ann Bray's 'Allegory in *Navigatio Sancti Brendani*' (pp. 175-186). Séamus Mac Mathúna 'Contributions to a Study of the Voyages of St Brendan and St Malo' (pp. 157-174) attempts to establish the relation of some voyage episodes in the *Vita Brendani* and the *Vita Machutis* 'Life of St. Malo'. J.J. O'Meara's 'In the Wake of the Saint: The Brendan Voyage, an Epic Crossing of the Atlantic by Leather Boat' (pp. 109-112) (*Times Literary Supplement*, 14. 7. 1978) used the publicity of Tim Severin's adventurous journey across the North Atlantic in a leather boat to draw a wider audience's attention to the original text of NSB.

James Carney's important 'Review of *Navigatio sancti Brendani Abbatis*' (pp. 42-51), hitherto not easily accessible, sparked off a controversy with Proinsias Mac Cana about the native or Christian origin of the genre. Of Mac Cana's three articles on the subject one, 'The Sinless Otherworld of Immram Brain' (pp. 52-72), has been included in the present volume. Unfortunately the other two: 'Mongán Mac Fiachna and Immram Brain' (1972) and 'On the Prehistory of Immram Brain' (1975) had to be left away, obviously because of the restricted space. Still, 'The Earliest Bran Material' (pp. 73-90) by James Carney has been reprinted.

In 'Two Approaches to the Dating of *Nauigatio Sancti Brendani*' (pp. 120-132) David Dumville uses a genealogical argument to date the composition of NSB before the year 786. I myself proposed a date of ca. 825 (David Stifter (1997), *Philologica Latino-Hibernica: Nauigatio Sancti Brendani*, Thesis, Wien, 109-110), based on apparent textual correspondences of some island descriptions with passages in Dicuil's *Liber de Mensura Orbis Terrae* and on NSB's possible provenance from the Carolingian Empire. Dumville's and my proposals do not necessarily contradict each other: the Middle Latin text may well have received its final shape, together with some adaptations concerning the contents, at the beginning of the 9th century on the Continent, based on an older 'Proto-Nauigatio' (probably in Latin, but perhaps in Old Irish) from Ireland. Séamus Mac Mathúna mentions a similar idea (p. 158). This theory finds some support in Michaela Zelzer's observation in *Friihe irische Amerikafahrten und monastische Reform* (*Wiener Humanistische Blätter* 31 (1989), 66-87), that monastic traits apparent in certain episodes of NSB could be linked with the Benedictine reform movement of Benedict of Aniane under the rule of Louis the Pious (814-840 AD). In this context I must say, that on the whole the NSB's Continental connections have been somewhat neglected in the present volume, which lays its main stress on the text's Irish background.

The last three articles are original contributions to the volume. Kevin Murray discusses in 'The Role of *Cuilebad* in *Immram Snédgusa 7 Maic Riagla*' (pp. 187-193) the motif of a token as proof for the veracity of the Otherworld Voyage, exemplified by the flabellum (the liturgical fan, Irish *cuilebad*) of Colum Cille. Thomas Owen Clancy stresses in 'Subversion at Sea: Structure, Style and Intent in the *Immrama*' (pp. 194-225) the penitential character of the

voyage tales. He concentrates on their individual structures, on their different styles and on the purposes underlying the texts. He sees in them tales about the saving of souls which use a voyage on the sea as the means of redemption. To examine the relationship between NSB and historical monastic voyaging between ca. 560 and 800 AD is the goal of Jonathan Wooding in 'Monastic Voyaging and the *Nauigatio*' (pp. 226-245). He argues that historical peregrinations of Irish settlers to the Faroes and to Iceland in the 8th century are reflected in the narrative and played a rôle in the development of the voyage motif in the Brendan legend out of its Hiberno-Latin precursors.

In an appendix Karen Jankulak gives a 'Translation of Selected Passages from the History of Enoch and Elia, Satirical Verses concerning St Brendan and Nicolaus de Bibera, Carmen Satiricum' (pp. 246-250). Regrettably Jankulak confines herself to translating those Latin passages that Mario Esposito (see above) quoted in his article, written at a time when a scholar could still expect his audience to be able to read Latin. Of the satirical poem on St. Brendan, which has 52 lines in the original (printed in: Charles Plummer (1910), *Vitae Sanctorum Hiberniae*, Volume II, 293-294) Jankulak, closely following Esposito, offers only a selection of 12 verses. It would not have inflated the size of the book overduly to have included the other 40 lines as well. Jankulak's translations are not always reliable: '*accedant scire volentes*' (p. 41, l. 1556) does not mean '[if] those wishing to know should draw near [they say]' (p. 250), but rather 'let all those who want to know draw near'; 'simply terrestrial [life], land' (p. 249) is a fanciful translation of '*terra nuda*' (p. 40, l. 39), which correctly should be 'bare land, uninhabited land'.

A bibliography ends the book (pp. 251-277). Although about 750 (!) titles are collected here, this is only a fraction of the scholarship dedicated to Irish voyage literature, and, as already noted above, much deserving recognition and inclusion has been omitted. Of monographical studies concerning NSB I can mention for example Dominique Daly (1905) 'The Legend of St. Brendan', *Celtic Review* 1; Dora Faraci (1988) '*Navigatio Sancti Brendani* and Its Relationship with Physiologus', *Romanobarbarica* 11; or recently Anthony Harvey, Jane Power (1997) 'Hiberno-Latin scaltae', *Ériu* 48. Of texts neighbouring the voyage genre Georg Schade's (1869) edition of '*Visio Tnugdali*', Halle; and Jean-Michel Picard (1989) 'The Vision of Tnugdali', Dublin could have been added. Kim McCone's (2000) '*Echtrae Chonnlai and the Beginnings of Vernacular Narrative Writing in Ireland: A Critical Edition with Introduction, Notes, Bibliography and Vocabulary*', Maynooth Medieval Irish Texts I, Maynooth has appeared too recently (summer 2000) for the present bibliography, yet it must not go unmentioned in a discussion of voyage literature, especially the lengthy chapter on 'Some questions of context and interpretation' (pp. 47-119). It is to be expected that these books and more will be included in the Brendan-bibliography put together by Glyn Burgess and Clara Strijbosch ('*The Legend of St Brendan a critical bibliography*', Dublin), due to be out early in 2001.

To sum things up, it can be said that the present volume is a highly readable and useful book for all those who want to get a first overview over the scholarship on early Irish voyage literature, and yet at the same time a very valuable book also for those who have already taken their first steps into the genre on their own, as it assembles studies which until now had been widely scattered and were often published in obscure places.