

Kerr, A., King O Riain, R., and Titley, G., (2013) 'Transnational Media Networks and the 'Migration Nation' in Gilmartin, M. and White, Allen, *Migrations: Ireland in a Global World*, Manchester University Press. Chapter 5, pg. 98-114. ISBN 97808-7190-8551-2

## **INTRODUCTION: TRANSNATIONALISM AND 'INTEGRATION'**

While migration has become emblematic of an era of accelerated globalization in Ireland, public and political discourse rarely approaches migration and migrant lives with the same attention to connexity and flow evident in discussions of economic transformation, national 'brand management', and the banal and aspirational transnationalism of consumerist lifestyles, investment opportunities and privileged mobilities.

Concomitantly, while discussions of diaspora in Ireland have shifted from the Robinson-era rehabilitation of transnational affect and historical bonds to considerations of the 'Global Irish' as a diasporic network of expertise, investment, and political and cultural capital (Boyle and Kitchin, 2008), the transnational connections inhabited by those moving to and dwelling in Ireland are largely disavowed in policy and official discourse. By way of example, the government strategy document on integration, *Migration Nation* (2008), invokes a titular concept suggesting transformative change while proceeding to discuss the integration of 'minority ethnic communities' without a single reference to the transnational socioscaples within which such communities are embedded, contested, reworked and evaded. Undoubtedly, the varying intensities with which the nationalist horizon of 'integration' is pressed, and the insistent sense of migrants as 'needed but unwanted' (Appadurai, 1996), serves to frame these connexities as potential barriers to integration. Axiomatically, perspectives committed to the legitimate presence and belonging of migrants in the nation-state may also pay attenuated attention to these dimensions in an era when migrant transnationalisms have become the focus of what William Walters (2004) terms 'domopolitics'; a politics of protecting the national home from bad, inutile or suspicious mobilities.

Nevertheless, transnational networks cannot be reduced either to the amorphous irritant précised by 'methodological nationalism' (Beck and Sznaider, 2006) or to apolitical, cosmopolitan fancy. Analytical attention to networks recasts the 'issue' of integration as a dimension of transnationalism. This attention has two key aspects. Firstly, the substantial gap between state rhetoric on 'integration', and structural limitations to

integration, must be recognized. This involves drawing attention to the non-integrating population management strategies of the 'market state' (Fekete, 2009; CARF, 2003); the circular migration practices and mobilities of extended European regional space (Favell, 2008); and the limited, stratified status possibilities and flexibilised pathways forced upon and forged by 'non-EU' migrants (Guild *et al.*, 2009). Secondly, attention to the multi-sited nature of personal relations, modalities of sociability and engagement, and affective and imaginative investments forged and shaped within transnational networks suggests how overlapping and ongoing processes of 'integration' may relate to each other.

Integration does not just involve one place, one pace, or one modality of life. Media use and engagement provides one key site where the integrative dimension of transnationalism is evident. In research conducted from 2007-9<sup>i</sup> and involving the diverse experiences of Chinese and Polish citizens in Ireland, we examined media practices as a formative dimension of transnational experience, and one that reveals ongoing, relational forms of negotiation in place and between places. The immanence of media in everyday life (Silverstone, 2007) positions the study of media practice in relation to wider practices, such as living arrangements, workplace dynamics, and generational and gendered issues and perspectives. Media use is inflected with personal history and biographical reflection, particularly for people whose experience of movement and mobility involves the accretion of relationships and connections stretched and mediated in space and time.

It is precisely for these reasons that attention to communication structures and networks, and media practices, has been formative to the study of migrant transnationalism. Steve Vertovec's (1999) familiar thematisation of transnational research, for example, is inconceivable without an infrastructure of instantaneous interconnection and mediated experience: transnationalism as social morphology, as type of consciousness, as mode of cultural reproduction, as avenue of capital, as site of political engagement, as reconstruction of place and locality. Nevertheless, as Myria Georgiou has argued, a dominant tendency towards unreflexive understandings of culture in transnational media research has arguably fashioned a curiously static understanding of networks, inadequate to '...the mobility and multipositionality of people, ideas, communications and cultures' (2007: 18). For that reason, we frame this discussion of media practices in terms of the

work conducted by Larsen, Axhausen and Urry (2006) on communications and ‘geographies of social networks’. As it happens, Larsen *et al.*’s approach is shaped by taking issue with the Other of culturalism’s over-determined migrant communities, that is, the autonomous and reflexive agent whose ‘networked individualism’ is taken to involve the dilution of kinship networks, thick affectivities and ties, and relations to place(s) (2006: 265-268). The suturing of an individualization thesis to the fact of mobilities involves an ontological collapse: physical distance as distancing, mobility as ‘freedom’. As against this, social networks are constituted through relational ties of care, support, affection and involvement at distance, where ‘presence is not reducible to co-presence...co-presence is both a location and a relation’ (Callon and Law, 2004: 6-9, cited in Larsen *et al.*, 2006: 265). To approach the interactivity of local positioning with distant ties and relationships, Larsen *et al.* suggest a concept of network capital as:

access to communication technologies, affordable and well-connected transport, appropriate meeting places and caring significant others that offer their company and hospitality. Without sufficient ‘network capital’ people are in danger of social exclusion...Network capital becomes highly pertinent as people seek to lead lives that are more geographically spread (Larsen *et al.*, 2006: 280)

In this chapter, we examine media and communication practices in terms of a broader conception of network capital, whereby mediated resources are deployed in negotiating co-presence relationally between different significant locations, between different and sometimes competing expectations of dwelling-in-place, and as in thinking about possible futures, here, there or elsewhere. While alert to the reductionist problems of ‘groupism’ (Brubaker, 2004), we conducted this research in relation to nationally-organised participants, as questions of language and particular media cultures are central to, but do not define, network capital. Moreover, mobility, status and future possibility are heavily circumscribed by national citizenship, and we sought to integrate these structural factors into the shape of networked practices.

## **ONE FOR EVERYBODY IN THE AUDIENCE: DENSE NETWORKS OF POLISH MEDIA TRANSNATIONALISM**

The post-2004 labour mobility<sup>ii</sup> and settlement of Polish citizens in Ireland has been characterized by complex circuits of labour mobility, the establishment of entrepreneurial, pastoral and cultural networks, and the emergence of ‘multiple, cross-national employment biographies’ (Wickham and Krings, 2010: 1; Krings *et al.*, 2009). Cheap air travel, security of status and freedom of mobility, and a highly mediated sense of ‘cultural compatibility’ referenced explicitly to Catholicism and implicitly to whiteness have provided Polish migrants with relatively high degrees of network and cultural capital.<sup>iii</sup> A number of recent studies have detected a tendency to subsume intra-European union migration to the paradigmatic assumptions of studies of non-EU migration, and in so doing, to miss the significance of an ‘emergent, regional-scale European territorial space’ shaping a ‘wider transnational horizon that encourages temporary and circular migration trends, and demands no long-term settlement or naturalization in the country of work’ (Favell, 2008: 706. See also Nolka and Nowosielski, 2009). It is in this space, and organized through distinct spatial clusters and a general critical mass of consumers within Ireland, that a material culture has taken shape (Rabikowska and Burrell, 2009). Central to this has been the development of media forms that, as we have argued elsewhere, cannot be understood as conventional ‘ethnic minority media’ addressing captive community audiences but are instead entrepreneurial, reflexive media artifacts shaped by a knowledge of a transnational spectrum of possibilities, and competing for the attention of dispersed Polish audiences (Kerr, 2007; Titley, 2008; Titley and Kerr, 2011). In turn, this spectrum is shaped by media connectivities that extend far beyond Polish and Irish-based sources.

This section draws upon focus groups in their native language with forty-five Polish nationals living in Ireland, conducted between 2008 and 2009.<sup>iv</sup> Most of our informants had moved to Ireland since 2004 in order to work in the construction industry, as professionals or in the service industry. Two thirds of our participants were aged between 20 and 34 years with a 60/40 male to female ratio. Half were single, a third married and the remainder either divorced or widowed. Overall our sample was reflective of the wider Polish population in Ireland in that they were primarily young, some were educated to degree level - but all had at least a secondary school qualification - and most were living in urban areas (CSO, 2008). Not all had come from Poland. Some had moved from third

countries and were accompanied by extended family networks that assisted with childcare. Most were living in rented shared accommodation, a set of arrangements that has an important, pragmatic impact on media access and media practices. The Polish population in Ireland is relatively dispersed, and to reflect this our research took place in Dublin, Limerick, Maynooth, Portlaoise and Cork (Gilmartin and Mills, 2008). Their spatial dispersal also meant that participants had different levels of access to local, national and transnational media and different levels of physical access to support and community structures.<sup>v</sup>

### **Transnational media flows and relational practices**

Even in the digital age, the satellite dish remains emblematic of transnational media use, and also symbolic of degrees of integration and orientation to the ‘host’ society. For some respondents, Polish satellite services such as Cyfra+ held strong class connotations, and featured as markers of negative distinction, i.e. of immigrants who were not making an effort to ‘integrate’. This positional sense does not capture the way in which Polish satellite services generally provided a particular kind of environmental resource within an inter-related set of practices and needs. As one working, female respondent described:

Concerning TV, because my family isn't familiar with English... it means my mom doesn't know the language at all and my husband just doesn't like it, so we have only Polish media at home. Polish TV in a cable. NTL or something... (M, FG1)<sup>vi</sup>

However within the domestic space, media use was also organized in terms of generational expectations and experiences of time. The need to create a secure linguistic environment for extended-family members coming for shorter stays made the co-temporal properties of live Polish television important in providing a particular experience of transnational time and space. The one-hour time difference ensured that favourite television shows from home – particularly soap operas, which are historically invested in creating a shared experience of national time-space - could be watched simultaneously with friends and family in Poland. This form of network capital contrasted with a future-oriented approach to children’s media use and its wider social implications:

Well we watch the British ones cause we have it. *BBC 1 to 4*. The kids watch *CBeebies*, and I also set Polsat in English – cause you can set the language and they don't know how to set it back to Polish. ... This was very helpful and now there are no problems at school at all. (M, FG6)

Moreover, several respondents were alive to the irony that the 'domestic' media spectrum in Ireland is historically transnational:

In Ireland I am interested in local media... It is in fact funny, because by "local media" I mean British media. (F, FG2)

Overall, what these discussions suggest is that media use within the home is shaped by questions of language, and strikingly different balances between the phenomenological comforts of Polish flow and an often instrumental approach to English-language media. This is perhaps most pronounced in frequent discussions of accent. A familiarity and ease with British and American media, and the experience of dealing with context-specific accents in social life in Ireland, produced a tension between, for example, listening to radio as an 'acculturation' tool and simply wanting to relax:

I listen. If I am in good mood I try to repeat. But in this case [I use] British and American TV more, not Irish one, as I am not very keen on the Irish accent. ... I think that at the beginning, when I came here, I was also subconsciously familiarizing myself with the accents, while watching Irish TV I was trying to distinguish various accents from the north or the south of the country... for sure it helped in becoming familiar with the accent. (P, FG5)

As several studies have argued, a culturalist preoccupation with questions of identity and belonging have frequently obscured the ways in which media use within the home is shaped by properly banal pursuits, and cannot be 'read' as recursive cultural practices with wider significance (Aksoy and Robins, 2000). Thus in these discussions, categories of taste and pleasure were central to media practices as domestic leisure:

I do not watch Irish TV because there is nothing interesting. Having Cyfra + or Polsat one have Discovery and other channels, there are plenty channels to watch. (G, FG3)

Nevertheless, it is important to note that even as leisure, discussions of media practices within the home were frequently organized by relational dynamics, whereby different choices were continually related to each other in oppositional and complementary ways. A pronounced criticism of broadcast media in Ireland was its perceived Anglo-American

orientation and distinct lack of educational and historically-focused programming, and the almost complete absence of programmes from other European countries and in other languages. Approached in this way, Polish media flow is also a cosmopolitan presence, broadening their mediascape beyond dualities of 'home' and 'away'. Similarly, relational readings of transnational or ethnic news about Poland, or about European affairs from Irish media sources, prompted reflections on the perceived political conservatism and 'ideological bias' of mainstream Polish sources. A pronounced dimension of relational viewing is an evaluation as to ultimately what counts as 'news':

At the beginning when I came here ... it was extremely strange for me watching TV news about nothing, about the fact that someone's field was flooded. It was a great news! I was very relaxed watching that kind of news. Nobody was giving me all that political crap ...It was so soft, gentle stuff in Irish TV. (G, FG1)

However this threshold is national, not local, and the scale of the media operation is important in different aspects of social life. Many participants emphasized the importance of news about their locality, and radio, newspapers and free-sheets were most important in this regard. In particular, some participants who had been made unemployed discussed the role of both national and local radio in accessing news and entertainment, but also in maintaining a felt connection to society beyond the home. In the same context, libraries became important meeting places, sources of free access to newspapers, and to Internet. However, for all the fragmentation of contemporary mediascapes, it was notable that many participants discussed the importance of national media in both Poland and Ireland in moments of 'shared ritual' in key sporting, social and political events. In other words, rather than there being a transition from the national-integrative dimensions of broadcasting in an 'era of scarcity' to the multiplicity of a digital 'era of abundance' (Ellis, 2000), the experience of transnational multi-positionality enhanced the importance of feelings of mediated togetherness made possible by key media events both 'here' and 'there'. Occasionally these events converge; the death of President Kaczynski in April 2010 saw public screenings of the funeral and extensive coverage in the Irish media.

Internet access, and the development of wireless and mobile technologies have accelerated the immanent transnationalism of everyday life. However reliable Internet access is an important, material form of network capital, and important regional

disparities emerged between participants, with those interviewed in Cork and in rural locations drawing attention to the poor quality of service. Online sources were crucial in sourcing up-to-date information on arrival in Ireland, and online communication platforms significantly reduced communication costs allowing for the daily maintenance of dispersed ties through phone calls, text messages and a variety of chat programmes and social networks. Many participants sourced multiple forms of Polish media online, as the digitalization of newspapers, television services, radio programmes and films has opened up significant, ongoing and co-temporal access to national media.

Yes, we listen radio via Internet - Zlote Przeboje, Radio Gdansk and PR 3 in my case. We also browse news portals like WP.pl and Onet.pl (L, FG1.)

I watch sometimes. In internet. Polish TV series. Recently "Kryminalni" (B, FG2) However, reliable internet access also serves to provide access to a global mediascape, and in contexts of shared living arrangements and the costs associated with television ownership, the laptop also becomes a surrogate television and source of eclectic programming, used to download films, music and programmes from a broad 'elsewhere':

I have no TV set at that moment so I watch what I can find in internet. Documentary movies mostly. (F, FG2)

Of course, as with orientation towards news, online orientations are also local, and participants regularly used the Internet to search for jobs, accommodation, and local news and events. However many drew attention to the lack of useful sites with regularly updated information. The ways in which online media exacerbate expectations around speed and instantaneity is evidenced in the impact of online sources on the nonetheless active mini-industry of Polish media developed in Ireland. At a basic level, physical access was heavily dependent on regional position, as these newspapers were mainly available in Dublin shops, and occasionally from street vendors and through church networks. However these media were also interpreted within the transnational mediascape, and therefore evaluated for relevance, quality, form and content against a range of competitors. Many participants regarded them as useful 'first contact' media, of diminishing interest for those who had spent some time in Ireland, and comparatively 'amateur' or simply re-mediated and out-of-date versions of instantaneously available

online media. Similarly, the raft of programmes developed by community and commercial local and regional radio stations (Tittley *et al.*, 2010: 158-170) were held to cater to a 'stereotypical' Pole and unable to reflect the diversity and differences within the Polish community. Yet, in an opinion expressed by other participants in the project, conventional forms of multicultural broadcasting and publishing may often be of limited interest, but they were widely regarded as a form of symbolic capital, as a sign of presence in the local public sphere.

### **THE TIES THAT BIND: CHINESE TRANSNATIONAL MEDIA PRACTICES**

While there has been a small but growing Chinese community in Ireland since the 1970s, the size and diversity of this community has increased dramatically over the past 15 years to 16,500 in the 2006 census (CSO, 2008). Chinese people living in Ireland currently tend to migrate from many different areas of mainland China (with large groups coming from Shenyang, Shanghai, and Beijing). Many have come to Ireland as students and are relatively young and unmarried. Both men and women have come to Ireland to learn English and to better their employment opportunities. Because Chinese students have been allowed to work part time, many young Chinese can be seen in low wage service jobs (particularly in catering and service/hotel industries) in addition to their study.

Five focus groups (of 5 participants each) were conducted with Chinese migrants in 2008, residing primarily in and around Dublin.<sup>vii</sup> The focus groups were conducted in Mandarin by Weiming Liu and the participants ranged from 23–46 years of age and were predominantly women. All of the participants came to Ireland initially as students (many to study English) and many worked part time as: health care assistants, cleaners, waiters/waitresses, and language teachers. Two had moved to a work visa to work in health care provision (nursing) but were on temporary work visas and none were naturalized at the time of the focus group thus their was a sense of their transitory non-permanent visa status in Ireland. Most Chinese participants were single (the CSO found on average that 71% were single), but some were married with spouses here and at home. Some participants had been here less than a year (7 months) while some as much as seven years.

The Chinese people interviewed in this study found that they had links and networks to people and places both locally (translocalism), nationally and transnationally. Their media uses and opinions of the Irish and Chinese local media in Ireland reflect this orientation. They engaged with Irish media sources and Irish based Chinese ‘ethnic media’ sources, but only intermittently and with limited interest. Once again, because of the centrality of speed and instantaneity to feelings of co-presence, the routines and forms of these sources do not reflect their transnational lives and interests. Digital media sources and platforms structure their communications, and their structural-legal position as ‘temporary migrants’ or students impacts on their living arrangements, propensity to invest in, for example, television and the licence fee, and thus on the scope of their media field. They also have come from China with considerable cultural, social and technological capital, which some have been able to parlay in Ireland into ‘network capital’. Transnationally oriented media practices reinforced their personal and Chinese diasporic networks and made their network capital denser. In some respects, it means that they have meaningful and strong, but spatially distant, social ties to others, which are cultivated and maintained through the time-space coordinates of digital media use.

In doing so the Chinese participants are less integrated ‘into’ Ireland as a place. Rather ‘Ireland as a place’ is integrated into their existing and emerging transnational networks. As a result, Ireland is put ‘on the map’ in the Chinese diaspora by Chinese people living in Ireland, in part through their media practices. Thus, in media as well as wider social terms, it is neither ‘integration’ into Ireland nor ethnic self-segregation in enclaves but ongoing integration into transnational (media) practices that flow multilaterally through networks of migrants in the Chinese diaspora. Within these networks, Ireland as a site is evaluated primarily through questions of scale. It is worth noting that participants from bigger cities in China normally have access to Internet connections that are far faster than much of rural or even suburban Ireland, but this may not be representative of all Chinese in Ireland. Discussions of news also illustrate the centrality of perceptions of scale and parochialism in Irish media. There was a widespread consensus among Chinese focus group members that they only read Irish newspapers if they were available for free (*Metro* or *Herald a.m.*). If they were ‘lying around at work in the staff room’ then they

might pick them up, but for the most part they did not read them with any regularity or consistency. The following exchange is indicative:

Girl 1: The Irish news is very trivial and there is nothing worth reading. For the moment, the biggest news is about if the Irish ... [Forgets the word]

Girl 4: [Reminds girl 2 of the word] Taoiseach.

Girl 1: [Continues]... Taoiseach took a bribe. [This case] has been investigated for two years and is still not finished. Other news covers stories on car accidents or murdering cases [in Ireland]. There is little coverage of international news.

Girl 5: The country is small. There isn't much news.

Girl 1: The country is small.

Girl 4: That's right. As far as I know, we're not the only ones [who don't like the Irish news]. Irish people don't read it either. There isn't much news to read. A lot of people like BBC [news].

The 'country is small, there isn't much news' is a recurring motif in these audience studies, sometimes produced by differences in news values, but in the case of Chinese respondents, by the differences in scale that define thresholds for what counts as 'news'. They felt that the Irish news was very locally focused, with 'local' functioning also as a measure of how the value of news was evaluated by them, as one female participant in her mid twenties from Beijing explained: "If there is a traffic accident, it can be reported on the national news." Relational engagement happens along several axes, not just as a comparison between Chinese and Irish sources. British television services served as another point of comparison, with accent (although not American English accents) once again cited as a barrier in broadcasting, while the greater multiculturalism and internationalism of British television was meaningful to several participants. However news was also monitored for issues of potential relevance to their insecure visa status and situation. This came up in a different focus group in this manner:

Interviewer: Do you keep up with Irish news?

Girl 1: No, I don't.

Girl 4: No, not really unless [the Irish news] is related to immigration, visas, education policies.

Girl 1: Yes, that's right. And the news, which may help to find jobs [attracts my attention].

Girl 3: Yes, [I would be interested in] news on immigration, visa regulations.

Girl 1: I would be interested in the news concerning Chinese[immigrants].

In an interesting parallel with Polish participants, a recurring criticism of Irish broadcasting was the perceived narrowness of its acquisitions and range of reference. In a period when broadcasting in Ireland has engaged with the question of a new ethno-cultural diversity in its audiences, diversity is understood by a sample of these audiences not as a question merely of representation, but more importantly, as a diversity of sources, aesthetics, genre and scope. One focus group member in her late twenties highlighted this when she said:

There has been a deep impression on me since I came here [to Ireland]. When I was in China, there were a lot of foreign movies, including both European movies and American movies. But in Ireland, I don't see a Chinese movie on Irish TV even once a month. Even in cinemas, there might be a Chinese or Asian movie every two or three months. Very few [Chinese or Asian movies] are available [in Ireland]. The cultural exchange is unbalanced.

In a continuance of the parallel, the Irish-based Chinese 'ethnic community' media were rejected for many of the same reasons. The participants reported that they didn't read Chinese 'ethnic' newspapers like the *Shining Emerald* or the *Chinese News Express* (now *Irish Chinese News*) that often. Much like their general newspaper consumption, it was opportunistic; if they happened to be in a Chinese restaurant they might pick it up, but they did not buy them or read them regularly. By also criticizing what they saw as the derivative and untimely nature of these sources, they demonstrate how certain forms of media are being forced to re-think the forms of network capital they are capable of

offering, when both their functional (jobs, ads, news) and affective (sense of shared engagement, networking) dimensions have been diminished by communicative forms more widely associated with individualism and fragmentation:

Girl 5: They don't have much information from back home. *Ireland Chinese News* hardly has anything [any information from back home].

Girl 1: Some [information in the Chinese newspapers] is copied from internet.

Girl 3: Everything [is copied from internet].

Weiming: Are you interested in the news [in Chinese newspapers]?

Girl 1: No. [I'm not].

Girl 1: The news is not updated.

Girl 1: [The news is] copied [from internet].

Girl 5: They're weekly newspapers, are they?

Girl 1: *Shining Emerald* has improved a lot. There used to many wrong spellings. The quality [of the spelling] was terrible. It has improved a lot.

However, it is important to reflect how the possibilities afforded by the thick lattice of connectivity available to them are ambivalent, enforcing feelings of distance as much as transcending them. The acuity of news about China was amplified by general dynamics of being outside looking in, particularly for participants who routinely discussed their imagined futures as being 'back' in China. Extensive network capital may also breed insecurity about future readiness, or to put it another way, a profoundly mediated sense of co-temporality and co-presence also rubs up against insistent feelings of the 'real', and of the excess reality that always evades mediation:

Girl 2: I also feel that we're isolated from our fellow countrymen when we go back home on holidays or for other reasons. There is a generation gap.

Girl 5: It seems that we're backward. Actually, the backwardness only means that we fail to keep up with news from back home.

Girl 1: I keep up with the news from back home everyday.

Girl 2: It still feels different to read online.

While most participants possessed a PC and frequently used webcams, the near-daily involvement in online chat – mainly Skype and QQ, a Chinese languages based chat platform – also saw them heavily involved in the networks of Chinese Internet cafes dotted around Dublin, but particularly in the north inner city. This may also relate to a developing tendency to maintain personal 'blogs', both as a way of communicating with more networked acquaintances more efficiently, but also as working from Irish IP addresses allowed them access to a range of 'dissident' websites:

Girl 1: It's [www.6park.com](http://www.6park.com). It's a foreign website. But it's created by Chinese people.

Girl 3: That website doesn't look professional. But a lot of people browse it.

Girl 1: The information at that website is regularly updated. [This website] is forbidden in [the mainland of] China.

Girl 5: [To girl 1] Is that because some articles are a bit too ... [unacceptable by the Chinese government]?

Girl 2: It [[www.6park.com](http://www.6park.com)] contains some news, which is not seen in China.

## CONCLUSION

Media and communication practices provide a useful modality for thinking about the shifting connectivities of transnational lives, including modalities of integration. Beyond either new media utopianism or tired visions of media enclaves, the findings and discussions presented here suggest how media resources provide forms of network capital that are multivalent and oriented towards ongoing and divergent forms of integration in *places* and in *times*. While the maintenance of social networks, the affective dimensions

of co-temporality and a suite of pragmatic considerations and limitations oriented many participants towards online media forms and satellite broadcasting, it must be stressed that these practices are not linear, but dialectical.

While the Polish and Chinese participants in our study differed demographically, legally, geographically and in terms of media practices, they all engaged with, and critically accessed Irish, 'community', diasporic and transnational media *relationally*. These relations and uses change over time, and are frequently shaped and re-shaped by the life course of people's migration and settlement, and by their affective relationship to Ireland shaped by the restrictions and possibilities of legal status. Assessments of, and involvement in, transnational media are every bit as reflective and ambivalent as those expressed in relation to the Irish, national media sphere. Both Poles and Chinese participants were critical of 'official' and 'commercial' media discourses in transnational media and both sought alternatives in unofficial and personal communicative networks. This insistent relationality, we argue, indicates how considerations of 'integration' are central to transnational practices and, as the Polish experience indicates, this consideration is intensified by generational considerations. Indeed Larsen *et al.* (2006) argue that relationality is a general property of social network geographies, involving the maintenance of different amalgams of ties, embodied and mediated communicative relations to place, and forms of interpersonal engagement that attempt to interrelate proximate and 'socialising at-a-distance' (2006: 280). Approached in this way, it makes little sense to juxtapose the 'transnational' with being 'integrated', as in experiential terms they are dialectically interconnected.

In an article assessing the continued relevance of the paradigm of transnationalism to migration studies, Janine Dahinden asks 'are we all transnationals now?' (2009: 1365). In other words, in social contexts characterized by multiple forms of mobility and everyday transnational interconnection, and in nation-states where public discourse is increasingly reflexive as to the impact of global processes and transnational actors on diminished or reformed understandings of national sovereignty and exceptionalism, the question arises as to the specific analytical value of transnationalism to the discrete study of networks and socio-cultural practices formed in and through migration. The question is an

interesting one, precisely because the paradigmatic value of transnationalism has involved a cumulative questioning of the ontological terms of migration studies. It encompasses not only a response to the freighted political accents of the categories of 'migration' and the 'migrant', but it underlines their unsettled analytical status in societies marked by networks of diverse human, material, informational, and ideological mobilities (Appadurai, 1996). Under such conditions, for example, what modalities of life count as integrated, for whom, and in what ways? As Dahinden asks, '...does one need to be globally mobile in order to be transnational or do the non-mobiles also display some sort of transnationalism?' (2009: 1366). In contemporary Ireland this is an enormously pertinent question. Moving beyond the here/there either/or binaries that often frame migrant lives must also involve making good on the implications of relationality and analyzing migrant transnationalisms as a part of the dense lattice of transnational flows that impact upon and are integrated into individual lives, localities and social terrains more generally.

## REFERENCES

- Aksoy, A. and K. Robins (2000) 'Thinking across spaces: transnational television from Turkey', *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, 3, 343-365.
- Appadurai, A. (1996) *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Beck, U. and N. Sznaider (2006) 'Unpacking cosmopolitanism for the social sciences: a research agenda', *British Journal of Sociology*, 57, 1-23.
- Boyle, M. and R. Kitchin (2008) Towards an Irish diaspora strategy: a position paper. NIRSA working paper No. 37. *NIRSA working papers* Maynooth.
- Brubaker, R. (2004) 'Ethnicity without groups', in R. Brubaker (ed.) *Ethnicity without Groups*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Callon, M. and J. Law (2004) 'Guest Editorial', *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, 22, 3-11.
- CARF (2003) 'Racism and the Market-State: An Interview with A. Sivanandan', *Race and Class*, 44, 71-76.
- CSO (2008) Population and Migration Estimates April 2008. Cork., Central Statistics Office.
- CSO (2008) Census 2006 – Non-Irish Nationals living in Ireland. Profiles 1-5 - UK, Polish, Lithuanian, Nigerian, Latvian. Cork Central Statistics Office.

- Dahinden, J. (2009) 'Are we all transnationals now? Network transnationalism and transnational subjectivity: the differing impacts of globalization on the inhabitants of a small Swiss city', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 32, 1365-1386.
- Ellis, J. (2000) *Seeing Things. Television in the Age of Uncertainty*. London: IB Tauris.
- Favell, A. (2008) 'The new face of East-West migration in Europe', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 34, 701-716.
- Fekete, L. (2009) *A Suitable Enemy? Racism, Migration and Islamophobia in Europe*. London: Pluto.
- Georgiou, M. (2007) 'Transnational crossroads for media and diaspora: three challenges for research', in O. Bailey, M. Georgiou and R. Harindranath (eds) *Transnational Lives and the Media*. Basingstoke; Palgrave Macmillan.
- Gilmartin, M. and G. Mills (2008) 'Mapping Migrants in Ireland: The Limits of Cartography', *Translocations: Migration and Social Change*, 4, 21-34.
- Grabowska, I. (2005) 'Changes in the international mobility of labour: Job migration of Polish nationals in Ireland', *Irish Journal of Sociology*, 14, 27-44.
- Guild, E., K. Groenendijk and S. Carrera (2009) 'Understanding the contest of community: illiberal practices in the EU?', in E. Guild, K. Groenendijk and S. Carrera (eds) *Illiberal Liberal States? Immigration, Citizenship and Integration in the EU*. Farnham: Ashgate.
- Haynes, A., E. Devereux and M. Breen (2009) Media, migration and public beliefs in the Republic of Ireland. *Translocations: Migration and Social Change*, 5.
- Kerr, A. (2007) 'Transnational flows: media use by Poles in Ireland', in J. Horgan, B. O'Connor and H. Sheehan (eds) *Mapping Irish Media: Critical Explorations*. Dublin: UCD Press,
- Krings, T., A. Bobek, E. Moriarty, J. Salamonska and J. Wickham (2009) 'Migration and Recession: Polish Migrants in Post-Celtic Tiger Ireland', *Sociological Research Online*, 14, 9.
- Larsen, J., K. Axhausen and J. Urry (2006) 'Geographies of Social Networks: Meetings, Travel and Communications', *Mobilities*, 1, 261-283.
- Nolka, A. and M. Nowosielski (2009) 'Poles Living in Ireland and their Quality of Life', *Journal of Identity and Migration Studies*, 3,1: 28-46.
- Office of the Minister for Integration (2008) *Migration Nation. Statement on integration strategy and diversity management*. Dublin: Government of Ireland
- Rabikowska, M. and K. Burrell (2009) 'The material worlds of recent Polish migrants: transnationalism, food, shops and home', in K. Burrell (ed) *Polish Migration to the UK in the New European Union after 2004*. Farnham, Ashgate.
- Silverstone, R. (2007) *Media and Morality. On the rise of the mediapolis*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Titley, G. (2008) 'Researching media transnationalism in "multicultural" Ireland: an exploratory discussion of Polish media practices', *Translocations: Migration and Social Change*, 3, 1:29-49.
- Titley, G. and A. Kerr (2011) 'Here, there and everywhere: Polish media transnationalism', in B. Fanning and R. Munck (eds) *Immigration and the Irish Experience of European and Global Transformation*. Farnham; Ashgate.
- Titley, G., A. Kerr and R. King O'Riain (2010) *Broadcasting in the New Ireland. Mapping and Envisioning Cultural Diversity*. Dublin: BAI.

- Vertovec, S. (1999) 'Conceiving and researching transnationalism', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 22, 447 – 462.
- Walters, W. (2004) 'Secure borders, safe haven, domopolitics', *Citizenship Studies*, 8, 237-260.
- Wickham, J. and T. Krings (2010) Polish migration to Ireland: new mobilities in an enlarged EU. *Migrant Careers and Aspirations Project Newsletter No. 4* Dublin, Trinity College.

---

<sup>i</sup> The authors would like to acknowledge funding from the Broadcasting Authority of Ireland, the support of colleagues at NUIM and the generosity of our participants. The full project report is available at [http://www.bai.ie/funding\\_research.html](http://www.bai.ie/funding_research.html) or a hard copy can be requested from [gavan.titley@nuim.ie](mailto:gavan.titley@nuim.ie)

<sup>ii</sup> Polish migration to Ireland existed before 2004 (Grabowska, 2005).

<sup>iii</sup> This has served to obscure discrimination faced by, for example, unemployed manual labourers (see Haynes *et al.*, 2009).

<sup>iv</sup> All of the data in this chapter come from a larger project entitled 'Broadcasting in the New Ireland: Mapping and Envisioning Cultural Diversity' funded by the BAI and published in 2010. The larger project directly compares the media use and practices of Nigerian, Chinese and Polish migrants in Ireland through focus groups conducted in the native languages of each group. The 7 focus groups here were conducted in Polish by two research assistants, Krzysztof Nawratek and Asia Rutkowska from NUIM. The groups were recorded and later translated and transcribed by the research assistants. As there is no nationally representative sampling frame from which to draw interviewees snowball sampling was used to recruit participants in focus group research. Participants were recruited from diverse areas in Ireland through community-based organizations, on-line venues of interest to migrants in Ireland (often in the native language), and through ads posted in migrant shops, at universities, and community centers. We did strive to have interviewees from diverse socio-economic, age and gender backgrounds and who came from different regions in their home countries. However, the data presented here are not generalisable to the larger migrant populations living in Ireland.

<sup>v</sup> Such as, for example, the Polish embassy, the Polish Social and Cultural Association, the Ireland–Poland Cultural Foundation and the Polish-Irish Society, all of which are located in Dublin. All of the above maintain websites and links to related centers in other countries.

<sup>vi</sup> Each quotation is labelled according to a participant code and focus group number.

<sup>vii</sup> The sampling strategy is explained in footnote iv above. The method of data analysis used was to conduct the qualitative focus groups, translate/transcribe the focus groups into English and then code them for comparison by themes relating to the areas of research: representation of the lives of migrants, the actual media world of migrants, the practices of migrants in relation to media use and migrant responses to broadcasting including public, community and commercial media sources.