

in the neo-Gregorian Proper chants analysed in this book. These musical characteristics consist of formulaic and repetitive musical ideas, a preference for stepwise motion and wavelike melodic profiles, and a continuous ornamentation of reciting notes. The conservation of the notes *b* and *E* as recitational notes observed in neo-Gregorian chants is viewed by Nardini as a regionalism rather than an archaism reflecting some pan-Mediterranean modal assessment.

In the Epilogue, Nardini wraps up the discussion and explains how, by means of the examination of neo-Gregorian chants, we can discover important information concerning the way in which a foreign musical style—the imported Gregorian chant with its formal structures—intermingled with the musical language and style of some indigenous musical dialects in the creation of new chants. A couple of useful appendices close the book. The first reviews all the texts of neo-Gregorian Proper chants in Beneventan manuscripts along with their concordances in Beneventan and non-Beneventan manuscripts; here, the chants are arranged by genre and their full text (from one selected source) is provided; this appendix is particularly useful as it represents the most comprehensive list of neo-Gregorian chants compiled so far. The second appendix lists all the manuscripts cited, first those in Beneventan script then all the others.

The undeniable importance of this book lies in the fact that it provides the first systematic study of a peculiar chant repertory originating in the blending of different styles. Neo-Gregorian chants are an exemplary case study for how local ecclesiastical communities acquired, understood, and reworked different musical languages with the ultimate goal of providing melodies. In her thorough analysis of the neo-Gregorian chants for the Proper of the Mass in Beneventan manuscripts, Nardini beautifully pinpoints the interlacing formal, stylistic, and thematic elements originating in different locales and periods, and shows how local cantors merged in some new pieces the formal structures of Gregorian genres with musical and textual features of more archaic musical traditions. In this respect, she demonstrates how the peculiar history of the Beneventan region, being at a crossroads of cultures, had a direct effect on its sacred musical repertory.

Despite occasional redundancies in the presentation of the argument, this book is essential reading for students and scholars interested in medieval plainchant and represents a fundamental point of departure for future research on neo-Gregorian repertoires in other parts of

Europe. It also represents a valuable example of a methodological investigation into a repertory whose musical transmission and tradition is extremely complex and fragmented. Luisa Nardini painstakingly puts together the scattered musical, textual, and liturgical elements of the neo-Gregorian Proper chants in Beneventan manuscripts and reconstructs, on a secure philological and methodological basis, their origins, transmission, and musical peculiarities.

ELSA DE LUCA

CESEM—NOVA University of Lisbon

doi:10.1093/ml/gcy040

© The Author(s) (2018). Published by Oxford University Press. All rights reserved.

*Music and Culture in the Middle Ages and Beyond: Liturgy, Sources, Symbolism.* Ed. by Benjamin Brand and David J. Rothenberg. Pp. xvi + 362. (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge and New York, 2016. £64.99. ISBN 978-1-107-15837-5.)

Though not readily apparent from the book blurb on the back cover and front page, the dedication page of Benjamin Brand and David J. Rothenberg's edited collection of essays signals this volume's *raison d'être*. Dedicated to Craig Wright, Henry L. and Lucy G. Moses Professor Emeritus of Music at Yale University, the fifteen chapters written by seven of Wright's former students and nine friends and colleagues embrace the interdisciplinary reach and focus of his musicological approach. Indeed, the editors explicitly organize the book's chapters into three sections that explore 'areas of inquiry in which Wright's research has proved particularly influential' (p. 3), that is: (1) Chant, Liturgy, and Ritual; (2) Archival and Source Studies; and (3) Symbolism. Within each section, a broadly chronological order is followed, with discussions of the cultural contexts of musical practice that range from ninth-century Reims to twentieth-century Los Angeles.

The book opens with Thomas Forrest Kelly's chapter. Despite its word count, it offers a wealth of material and understandings accumulated through years of research (this is also true of several other contributions to this volume), the bibliographic details of which are offered generously in several appendices. Kelly examines the remnants of liturgical practice extant from medieval Capua, an important city in the political and religious life of southern Italy, but from which, unfortunately, few sources are now extant (listed in Appendix 1). Only two music fragments

from the twelfth century survive, but Kelly also details the evidence of several later fourteenth- and fifteenth-century witnesses to the liturgical life of the city, which suggest to him that Capua, like much of southern Italy, once followed the Beneventan rite. The so-called 'model antiphons' that first appear in tenth-century tonaries are the focus of Barbara Haggh-Huglo's fascinating study. She proposes that these antiphons served as compositional models for those needing quickly to compose new office chants due to the increase in the translation of relics during the tenth and eleventh centuries (p. 45). Her analysis looks at Huchald's office *In plateis* (composed in Reims c.893–900) in comparison to several other early numerical office antiphons. Music examples demonstrate the degree of melodic correspondence between the *initia* and final cadences of the antiphons, although it would have been preferable to see full-page versions of Examples 2.3 and 2.4, and possibly in landscape orientation, in order more quickly to apprehend the melodic similarities and differences. Haggh-Huglo concedes that the 'subject of text-setting... is beyond the scope of this chapter' (p. 37 n. 27): it will be interesting to follow her subsequent research on this repertory to see if the consideration of the text alters any of the analytical conclusions proposed here.

Benjamin Brand's chapter examines liturgical polyphonic practice in medieval Tuscany, a largely extemporized art, traces of which are evident in a single Lucchese ordinal. Through a compelling reading of both architecture and musical practice, Brand outlines the historical evidence for reading the Tuscan pulpit as an important site for staging the public dimension of worship, often including prosulated or polyphonic Alleluias. Marica S. Tacconi's chapter is narrower in focus, examining in detail a single office composed in 1526 for St Zenobius. The cult of St Zenobius, traditionally regarded as the first bishop of Florence, was sustained for several centuries. Tacconi's chapter analyses the new Office of St Zenobius (thirty-five new chant texts and a substantial number of new melodies) composed during the first quarter of the sixteenth century, and the impetus behind its creation, namely as a vehicle for the Medici propagandists. Finally, Lorenzo Candelaria's vivid contribution transports the reader to sixteenth-century Mexico and the fall of Tenochtitlán, seat of the Aztec empire, on the feast of St Hippolytus in 1521. Candelaria's analysis of the detailed contemporaneous descriptions of the ceremonies of this feast day (published in Perugia 1579 within a preaching manual written by the Franciscan friar Diego Valadés)

demonstrates the ways in which the evangelization and 'spiritual conquest' of the New World combined Christian liturgy with pre-existent Aztec rituals.

Part II is entitled 'Archival and Source Studies' and looks broadly at the primary-source evidence for musical practice: from examinations of manuscript and printed music sources (in the contributions of Rebecca A. Baltzer, Mark Everist, and Jane A. Bernstein) to the important archival work still being carried out by a handful of musicologists, given exemplary representation here by Keith Polk, Margaret Bent, and Alejandro Enrique Planchart. Without doubt, Baltzer's chapter will be indispensable to those who research music in Paris in the later Middle Ages, for her examination of the chronology of additions and elevations to the Proper of the Saints in the liturgical use of Notre-Dame cathedral in Paris details the when and why of such changes. She also points us to the books that prove especially useful for an examination of particular repertories during specific time periods. Her analysis of these liturgical books offers caution regarding some assumptions about dating, summed up as follows: 'there are usually three dates to be established: the date of copying or production, the date represented by the calendar (if there is one), and the date of the contents of the sanctorale' (p. 139), each of which can be different. Indeed, she has found that very often the calendar represents a state five to fifteen years *earlier* than the date of the manuscript copying. There is good news in this, however, since she has found many sanctorales have no feast dating from after 1200. Therefore, despite the fact that there are no extant books *copied* during the twelfth century, we do actually have (unbeknownst to most of us) 'a whole armload [of books] whose contents represent a late twelfth-century state' (p. 140, and especially Tables 6.4 and 6.6).

The detailed study of a single motet voice, 'Ioliement veil mon chant retraire', copied in mensural (pre-Franconian) notation in the fragment Charleville-Mézières, Médiathèque Voyelles, 78 (fol. 110<sup>r</sup>), offers Mark Everist an opportunity to re-examine assumptions regarding thirteenth-century musical genres. Everist rightly questions the broad inclusion of items within Gaston Raynaud's *Recueil de motets français des xii<sup>e</sup> et xiii<sup>e</sup> siècles* (Paris, 1881–3) under the umbrella term 'motet' despite their origin in a variety of sources, polyphonic and monophonic, chansonnier and motet book. He proposes that an analysis of the textual form of pieces transmitted as single voices within the

broader context of thirteenth-century motet poetry can help answer some of these genre questions, although he cautions that answers to some of the key questions about the 'Ioliement' motet remain elusive (p. 156). Provocatively, Everist asks us to consider whether the mensural notation of 'Ioliement' might be 'concealed behind the unmeasured notation of all the other monophonic motets copied across the repertory of thirteenth-century chansonniers' (pp. 156–7).

Jane Bernstein looks to another crucial monophonic source, often ignored within histories of music printing, but which was in fact the first dated book and earliest extant publication issued on the Italian peninsula to contain music notation: the printed missal—*Missale Romanum*—published by Ulrich Han in Rome on 12 October 1476. This book preceded Petrucci's publication of polyphony using moveable type by twenty-five years. Bernstein attributes the success of Han's efforts to both the printer's technical abilities and entrepreneurship—especially his quick apprehension of the large potential market for a uniform printed missal—but also to the role of Pope Sixtus IV, who immediately understood the significance of the fledgling printing industry. The impact of this new technology was quickly recognized in Rome: Bernstein gives the example of a colophon stating that Han 'prints in one day what cannot be written in a year' (p. 215).

Craig Wright's archival work on the fifteenth-century Burgundian court and subsequently on Notre-Dame cathedral has provided a model of scholarship for a generation of scholars. Keith Polk, Margaret Bent, and Alejandro Planchart are also experts in this realm, and they too, like Wright, incorporate this expertise into their wider interpretations of musical practice. Here, Polk analyses the archival records that specifically mention instrumental performance, finding some 260 entries that relate to performances by players of soft instruments (fiddle, gittern, harp, chekker, lute, psalter, organ). Polk locates a fundamental change in performance practice (more ensembles of soft instruments) after about 1350. His chapter also briefly considers the archival evidence that documents the rise of the shawm band in the later fourteenth century. Bent fleshes out the career of one Melchior (or Marchion) de Civilibus, aka the 'Brescian provost', re-evaluating previously known documents in the context of her new discoveries in documents of Brescia, Padua, and Vicenza. This includes a fascinating new document confirming that Melchior was still alive in 1442 in the Veneto, and had at

that time requested absolution for his excommunication. Finally, Planchart's chapter examines documentation relating to the flow of musicians between Cambrai and Rome, which went both ways throughout the fifteenth century. Choirboys from Cambrai joined the papal chapel; adult singers from Cambrai joined the papal chapel; and musicians trained elsewhere came to Cambrai after their stint in Rome. This had a significant impact on the musical practice of Cambrai cathedral, which Planchart argues is especially evident after Du Fay's 'retirement' to Cambrai in 1439, and during his long subsequent service to this institution, which was home to so many former papal musicians of similar musical inclinations.

The third and final section of the book is titled 'Symbolism', with four chapters that interpret symbols as various as a fourteenth-century Rhenish 'Shrine Madonna' to the manifold Christian symbols that characterize three music videos of another Madonna (Ciconne, that is). David J. Rothenberg's contribution examines the manipulation of liturgical images generated by the tenor text of the unicum motet *Porta preminentie/Porta penitentie/PORTAS*, copied in the eighth fascicle of the Montpellier Codex. This three-voice Latin double motet, which Rothenberg dates c.1300, has a tenor on the chant melisma PORTAS (from the gradual *Tollite portas*) and texts that invoke the image of the Virgin Mary as both 'the gate through which Christ descended to earth and the gate through which those who prayed to her could ascend to heaven' (p. 237). This dual nature is exemplified in a genre of contemporaneous devotional sculpture of the Virgin, the Rhenish 'Shrine Madonna', which has doors that open up to reveal the Holy Trinity inside the sculpture's body. The motet, Rothenberg argues, plays on the liturgical associations of the chant in the construction of its poems and deployment of its polyphonic voices. Anne Walters Robertson turns to a motet composed not long after, ostensibly for the coronation of Philip V (r. 1316–22), crowned king of France on 9 January 1317. *Servant Regem/O Philippe/REX REGUM* was copied in the interpolated *Roman de Fauvel* (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, f. fr. 146), and in one other manuscript (f. fr. 571). Robertson proposes that the liturgical resonances of its poems, based on a variety of biblical verses, might have fitted best (functionally) as an appendage to the *laudes regie*, customarily sung just before or after the epistle at a coronation mass. She also proposes, on the basis of chant variants, that Vitry may be this motet's composer.

M. Jennifer Bloxam analyses Jacob Obrecht's five-voice polyphonic motet for the Dedication of the Church, *Laudemus nunc Dominum*, in the context of fifteenth-century sermon literature. Bloxam contends that 'Obrecht's penchant for musical sermonizing' (p. 291) is demonstrated in the stylistic differences (in both the construction of the texts and their musical treatment) between Obrecht's *Laudemus nunc Dominum* and his *Factor orbis*. She proposes that these differences in style and structure parallel contemporaneous developments in sermon construction: from the complex branching of the sermon 'trees' of Jacobus de Fusignano (d. 1333) to the pared-down structures exemplified in Johann Ulrich Surgant's *Manuale curatorum predicandi* (1503).

The final chapter of the volume, by Andrew Tomasello, abruptly transports the reader to the twentieth century. The Roman Catholic iconography of the 1980s Madonna triptych—music videos for the songs 'Like a Virgin', 'La Isla Bonita', 'Like a Prayer' directed by Mary Lambert—are analysed as a 'journey of connections though the interiority of their imagination, recall of learned reference, and evocation of familiar' (p. 311)—not so unlike, then, the close readings of the sources and compositions examined in the preceding chapters of this volume.

KAREN DESMOND  
Brandeis University  
doi:10.1093/ml/gcy044

© The Author(s) (2018). Published by Oxford University Press. All rights reserved.

*Motets from the Chansonnier de Noailles*. Ed. Gaël Saint-Cricq with Eglal Doss-Quinby and Samuel N. Rosenberg. Pp. 192. (A-R Editions, Middleton, Wis., 2017. \$360. ISBN 978-0-89579-862-6)

The history of the medieval motet is changing. This new edition of the ninety-two motets found in one of the main sources of trouvère song is one in a line of revisionist publications affecting that history, to the extent that, rather than continue to talk of 'the medieval motet' as if it were a single monolithic genre, it might be wiser to speak of 'medieval motets', a plurality of compositions with diversity in number of parts, transmission history, origins, meanings, compositional techniques, and reception.

No longer is the story a simple one of a piece of liturgical discantus on a plainsong melisma being texted as a way of troping a liturgical moment with eventual vernacularization offering a

Francophone audience some sophisticated poly-textual play. Recent scholarship on the motet has suggested instead that the influence sometimes went the other way, not least when the motets involve refrains, and that vernacular, courtly song might have been fashioned into polyphonic, and sometimes polytextual, motets that were then Latinized and offered to audiences for Christian devotional practices. Such revisions have been made by Catherine A. Bradley, working with the repertory in the earliest and most liturgically complete source, *F* (I-F1 Plut. 29.1), who notes the 'fundamentally non-linear nature of relationships between melismatic clausulae/discant and motets' ('Re-workings and Chronological Dynamics in a Thirteenth-Century Latin Motet Family', *Journal of Musicology*, 32 (2015), 153–97 at 154) and questions the automatic priority given to Latin over vernacular materials (see her 'Contrafacta and Transcribed Motets: Vernacular Influences on Latin Motets and Clausulae in the Florence Manuscript', *Early Music History*, 32 (2013), 1–70).

Bradley's arguments have coalesced with those made elsewhere by the main editor of the present volume, Gaël Saint-Cricq, who has examined song-like structures in motet melodies (see especially 'A New Link between the Motet and Trouvère Chanson: The *Pedes-cum-cauda* Motet', *Early Music History*, 32 (2013), 179–223). Both Saint-Cricq and Bradley have emphasized the complex interpenetration of thirteenth-century repertories traditionally separated as sacred and secular in both subject matter and origins: motet and song. In the present publication Saint-Cricq expands his narrative about the relation of motets to song culture by treating seriously the representation of the motets in a songbook, the songbook with the greatest number of motets, the so-called chansonnier Noailles, F-Pn fr. 12615, known to song scholars as trouvère MS *T* and to motet scholars as motet MS *N*.

While I shall here follow Saint-Cricq in opting for the latter siglum, *N*, the existence of dual sigla epitomizes the traditional separation of the scholarship on these two musical genres that scholars are newly now insisting maintain complex interrelations. Throughout his edition Saint-Cricq is at pains to give an explicit alternative view of medieval motets, emphasizing their use of song forms, refrains, generic subtypes like the *Kurz-mottette* and refrain-*cento*, and their extensive presence in a regional (Artesian) song manuscript that presents a repertory only partly overlapping with the better-known and more ecclesiastically focused motets of Paris. Nonetheless, assumptions about what