

The next chapter, entitled ‘Franco figures it out’, lays out the ground rules for Franco of Cologne’s system of regulating the duration of notes through their graphic shape on the page. It is in this chapter, and the next—on Philippe de Vitry and the invention of musical metre—that boxes, outlined with medieval-looking borders, begin to appear. These boxes set apart the more technical aspects of notational rules from the text for those who are interested in a slightly more rigorous discussion. In the final chapter, Kelly describes 14th-century Italian notation and links it to developments in the *Ars Subtilior* repertory denoted by, as he calls them, ‘weird shapes’ (p.180). By remarking on the consistency of the basic medieval ideas about notation through to the present day of musical scores, recordings and digitization, Kelly concludes the book.

For any student of medieval notations who has waded through the academic literature on the subject, there is much to be grateful for in this book: clear tables, beautiful colour images, accessible language. But apart from providing a light-hearted and jocular summary of the sometimes turgid discourse on the subject, it holds little new for the initiated. I imagine this book will work best in a museum gift shop or among the books in the music room at a high school. It adopts such an informal tone that I am tempted to use words like ‘casual’ and ‘disarming’ to describe it; in any case, it is the perfect antidote to the impenetrable and dowdy reputation of Medieval Studies. The accompanying CD provides recordings of some of the pieces discussed and reorients the reader to the idea of music as a primarily aural phenomenon, with notation as its somewhat haphazard, but always fascinating, protrusion into the visual realm.

doi:10.1093/em/cavo28

Advance Access publication April 4, 2015

## Karen Desmond

### Clergy and city

**Catherine Saucier, *A paradise of priests: singing the civic and episcopal hagiography of medieval Liège* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2014), \$75 / £50**

In *A paradise of priests*, Catherine Saucier weaves a compelling narrative centred on the lives of Liège’s founder-bishops as celebrated in the hagiography, art, rituals and music made, enacted and re-enacted by the medieval clerical population of Liège. Through an expert examination

of an impressively vast array of sources—including archival, liturgical, artistic and hagiographic—Saucier analyses the changing image of the city and its founder-bishops through nine centuries of documentary record. The story centres on the celebration of the lives and deaths of three bishops—Theodard (d. c.668), Lambert (d. c.700) and Hubert (d.727)—who were credited with the foundation, promotion and protection of Liège. Liège, a large and wealthy city, and capital of the prince-bishopric from 985, had large numbers of secular clergy, encompassing a cathedral and seven collegiate church chapters with approximately 270 resident canons by the mid-11th century (p.147). It was, as Petrarch observed, a ‘place noted for its clergy’ (p.4).

Saucier focuses on the secular establishments—the two important Benedictine monasteries of St-Jacques and St-Laurent merit just one passing reference (p.146)—since her concern is not with the medieval cultivation of Liège as an intellectual centre and place of learning. Rather, she seeks to articulate the secular clergy’s role, through their elevation of Liège’s bishop-founders, in promoting the civic status of their city, a city that was ‘the clerical, administrative, and musical headquarters of a vast diocese within one of the most urbanized regions of medieval Europe’ (pp.3–4). Her detailed archival work brings to light the inter-institutional exchanges between the city’s large numbers of singing priests, as documented in several accounts of specific liturgical celebrations, and exemplified by the career mobility of liégeois musicians such as the composer Johannes Brassart (c.1400–1455), and the singers Johannes Paulus and Johannes Crenwic (pp.163–6). Through her examination of a largely unstudied musical and liturgical repertory, Saucier makes the argument that ‘sacred music was the most pervasive and versatile medium by which the secular clergy of medieval Liège promoted the holy status of their city’ (p.3).

The first three chapters explore the expression of the city’s ideals in the hagiographical and liturgical celebration of each of the three founder-bishops. In chapter 1 (‘Martyred bishops and civic origins: promoting the clerical city’) Saucier explores the martyrdom of Saints Theodard and Lambert, and how the spilling of their blood was believed to have consecrated the site of their deaths: towns are transformed into cities because of such patronage (p.12). A 15th-century ode encapsulates the association of Lambert’s blood with the city’s success: ‘Holy Liège, fecundated by the blood of your patron, you are the elect of God: your clergy are like a bright flower; your people have a lion’s heart. Mountains and woods, springs, fresh air, fertile fields, rivers, meadows, vineyards in abundance,

coal fire, mines of lead and iron, these are your adornments and titles of glory, which render you equal to the greatest cities of the world' (quoted on p.13). Saucier finds that the emphasis on the civic—that is, the association of the martyrdom with the founding of the city—was absent from earlier hagiographic accounts, but was emphasized in the *vitae* for Theodard and Lambert by Sigebert of Gembloux (written c.1070–81) and Canon Nicholas's *vita* of Lambert (written 1144–5). This new civic emphasis in the 11th and 12th centuries left musical traces in chants appended to Theodard's liturgy, as for example in the Lauds antiphon *Sanctus itaque Lambertus* (analysed on pp.18–21) and in the accretions to Lambert's liturgy. These accretions, as exemplified in the newly composed 12th-century antiphon *Laetare et lauda* (pp.41–8), illustrate the development of Lambert's corporate identity just at the moment when the bishopric was expanding and establishing greater territorial control over the diocese.

Of the 13 bishops celebrated in the annual cycle of the liégeois liturgy, only Theodard and Lambert were classified as martyrs. Chapter 2, 'The intersecting cults of Saints Theodard and Lambert: validating bishops as martyrs', examines how the circumstances of their martyrdoms were tweaked—Saucier hypothesizes, for political purposes—in each retelling. Both saints were murdered by political rivals. Saucier describes how these politically motivated acts of violence were reimagined as divinely sanctioned martyrdoms (p.51). In one specific example Saucier notes how the pro-Carolingian Bishop Stephen, who composed the 10th-century Office for Saint Lambert, avoided the anti-royalty stance of that century's version of Lambert's martyrdom. But by the time Canon Nicholas penned his version, royal adultery was described as the precipitating factor for Lambert's demise, and he topically aligns the legend with 'episcopal oversight of royal morals and ecclesiastical control over matrimony' (p.72). Saucier analyses a hymn (*Hymnum cantemus gratiae*) and sequence (*Christi laudem predicemus*) transmitted in 14th-century service books that emphasizes these aspects of the story (pp.76–85). In chapter 3, 'The civic cult of Saint Hubert: venerating bishops as founders', she steps through eight centuries of accretions to the account of Hubert's life, including a detailed analysis of the dream of Pope Sergius in legend, art and music (pp.116–36). In this dream, an angel was said to have appeared to Sergius, instructing him to appoint Hubert as bishop and to give him the papal staff. In addition to the staff, Saucier highlights the references to the bishop's mitre in the musical and artistic traditions. These references were not present in any versions of Hubert's life (whether Latin or vernacular), which,

according to Saucier, 'suggests that chant and artwork were inspired by an alternat[iv]e, and perhaps nontextual, tradition' (p.121). This last point is dispensed with quickly and set aside. Saucier's analysis usually describes the unidirectional influences of the hagiographical literature on the liturgical repertory (that is, the chants adopt phrases and themes from the *vitae* and not vice versa), but one wonders about the symbiosis between what was surely a vibrant oral tradition and the surviving artefacts.

The final two chapters of the book move away from the hagiographical emphasis of the first three. We learn of Bishop Notger's expansion of the city in chapter 4 ('Clerical concord, disharmony, and polyphony: commemorating Bishop Notger's city') and the subsequent development of the cathedral chapter into what was essentially a 'corporation of lords' (p.147). Notger supervised the construction of an additional five churches in the city, and under his rule the cathedral became one of the most 'impressive ecclesiastical sites of the entire Western Empire' (p.140). Saucier details the play of power between the cathedral and the collegiate churches, but also the collaborative celebrations and processions in which they participated (pp.149–52). She closes the chapter with a plausible hypothesis on the possible performative contexts for Johannes Brassart's motet *Fortis cum quevis actio*.

Chapter 5, 'Military triumph, civic destruction, and the changing face of Saint Lambert's relics: invoking the *Defensor patriae*', examines the two feasts of Lambert's translation and triumph. The latter feast was instituted following the Battle of Steppes in 1213, which was 'remembered as one of the most significant victories in liégeois history' (p.174). The former feast was reinvigorated and moved to a new day following the success on the battlefield at Bouillon (1141), where Lambert's relics, which had been carried on to the battlefield with great ceremony, were credited with the success of the bishop's army. Saucier describes in fascinating detail the music that 'played a telling role in the veneration of Saint Lambert's relics before, during, and after the battle' (pp.171–2). The relics could not sustain their protective power, however, and just over two centuries later Charles the Bold 'authorized his troops to commit atrocities recalled by eyewitnesses in all their horror: rape, public hangings, mass drownings in the Meuse, rampant looting, and the desecration of the city's sacred spaces' (p.178). Charles did spare the churches of the secular clergy, and later demonstrated a special devotion to Lambert. And thus Lambert's cult and liturgy survived and flourished into the 16th century. Saucier outlines in evocative detail the description of a ceremony in 1489 when Lambert's

cranium was displayed to the entire religious populace of Liège, in an attempt to bring peace to the *patria* (pp.182–8), and Bishop Erard de la Marck's institution of an annual great general procession and eight-day fair in 1526 to coincide with the feast of Lambert's translation (pp.192–3).

Although most of the extant service books of Liège date from the 14th to 16th centuries—there is one 10th-century lectionary for the cathedral—Saucier appropriately supplements her analysis with other chant sources copied in close geographic proximity. Her mastery of her sources, and her focus on the development of this specific repertory, and on its political and institutional contexts, lends an impressive cohesiveness to her book. *A paradise of priests* is a must-read for anyone interested in how one might locate the fashioning of a city's image in the extant remains of story, art, music and ritual.

doi:10.1093/em/cav009

Advance Access publication March 30, 2015

## Andrew Cichy

### Byrd in context

**Kerry McCarthy, *Byrd*** (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), \$39.95 / £25.99

Recent decades have witnessed a blossoming in scholarship on William Byrd. After Oliver Neighbour's study of Byrd's consort and keyboard music and Joseph Kerman's monograph on his Masses and motets over 30 years ago (London, 1978 and 1981 respectively), new research by Davitt Moroney, Craig Monson, John Harley, Jeremy Smith, David Trendell, Philip Brett and Kerry McCarthy among others has substantially advanced the state of research on Byrd's life and work. Recent decades have witnessed a blossoming in scholarship on William Byrd. After Oliver Neighbour's study of Byrd's consort and keyboard music and Joseph Kerman's monograph on his Masses and motets over 30 years ago (London, 1978 and 1981 respectively), new research by Davitt Moroney, Craig Monson, John Harley, Jeremy Smith, David Trendell, Philip Brett and Kerry McCarthy among others has substantially advanced the state of research on Byrd's life and work. With the most recent biography of the Elizabethan composer written from a musicological standpoint dating from 1948 (the second edition of Edmund Fellowes's *William Byrd*), a new and updated text has been long overdue. Writing

such a biography today presents a formidable challenge: the world of 2014 is far removed from that of 1948, and interest in both Byrd and his oeuvre has increased as a result of the increased availability of his works in printed and recorded media. Meanwhile, as research on the politics, intrigue and religion of Elizabethan England has expanded, Byrd has again entered the spotlight—this time as a figure that carefully negotiated the difficult boundaries between conscience and country. McCarthy's new biography of William Byrd provides scholars, students, musicians and audiences alike with a detailed, scholarly monograph on the composer, written in engaging and lucid prose, which makes the book just as fitting for leisurely reading as it is useful as a reference text for scholars.

The most important aspect of this biography can be summed up in a single word: context. Byrd's life and output are skilfully presented in the rich contexts of Elizabethan history, the composer's networks, his contemporaries in England and on the Continent, his predecessors and his successors. It is no exaggeration to say that these contextualizations reach from cover to cover: the book's dust jacket reproduces the famous 1604 painting of the Somerset House conference (which commemorates the signing of a peace treaty between England and Spain) that hangs in England's National Portrait Gallery. On the first page of the preface, Byrd's connections with the various English, Spanish and Flemish noblemen depicted in the painting are noted, and it is later revealed that he also had rooms at the Earl of Worcester's home, only a few minutes' walk from the place where the treaty was negotiated. The image is thus part of a well-chosen opening gambit into the 'world in which Byrd's music was created and performed'—a world of 'luxury, gravity and political tension' (p.viii). It is also emblematic of McCarthy's approach to understanding Byrd: if the composer cannot be found in the historical foreground (just as no portrait that is contemporary with him is known to survive), through his social interactions and networks he can sometimes be discovered lurking in the background. And lurk he often does: in the same year as Charles Somerset made an inventory of his father's London residence, Byrd wrote his last will and testament, making mention of his 'lodging' in the same place; that the inventory includes copies of Monteverdi's fourth and fifth books of madrigals certainly invites some thought about Byrd's encounters with the Italian secular style, and McCarthy's suggestion that he may have spent his last years reading through these books is persuasive (p.211).

The text is cleverly structured, with some chapters devoted to what is known of Byrd's life and work, and others focused on specific aspects of his output. The scope of the latter chapters is impressive: sacred and secular vocal