## JOURNAL OF ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY

Protestant people, who, even when churchgoers, were keener on matins and evensong than communion, and were bound to be alienated by the twentiethcentury introduction of Tridentine teaching and liturgy. Canon Brown is weaker in the area of systematic historical exposition, as his mode of writing is more by anecdote than argument, with much picaresque and picturesque information on individual personalities and parishes. There is no attempt to compare the religious history of the mining and fishing villages of Cornwall with that of similar communities in other parts of Britain, which are known to have a special character; and the study would be stronger for some reference to the patterns of Cornish religious behaviour revealed by the 1851 religious census returns and by the Church's attitude to chapel radicalism and Liberalism. His interpretation of the changing role of the clergy could be expanded in the light of Anthony Russell's The Clerical Profession (S.P.C.K. London 1980); and there is room for a Cornish comparison with the religious experience of other minority episcopal churches of the Celtic fringe, in Scotland, Ireland and Wales. This monograph, therefore, lacks a political and social dimension which would increase its usefulness; and for all its virtues, it is not the last word on its subject. There can, however, be no doubt of the thoroughness and soundness of Canon Miles Brown's knowledge of Cornwall, its people and its Church which he serves and loves.

University of Durham

SHERIDAN GILLEY

The Roman Catholic Church in Ireland and the Fall of Parnell 1888-1891. By Emmet Larkin. Pp. xxi + 316 + 2 plates and 1 map. Liverpool University Press, 1979. £16.

The fall of Charles Stewart Parnell on the eve, as many thought, of the achievement of Home Rule is one of the most dramatic and tragic crises in modern Irish history and one which has exercised a fascination on writers ever since. Yeats' lines: 'The Bishops and the Party that tragic story made' sum up a popular myth (reflected in James Joyce's account of the spoiled Christmas dinner) that the Roman Catholic Church brought down 'the uncrowned king' of Ireland and harried him to his grave. Professor Larkin's study of the role of the bishops in the period leading up to the fall of Parnell is the most complete and satisfying account yet written. Although recent students of the period have given us the main lines of the story and furnished many of the conclusions Larkin arrives at, there is no other study that treats this important subject in such close detail. Based almost exclusively on archival matter, particularly the papers of the Irish bishops, their Roman agent, Archbishop Kirby and Cardinal Manning, this study brings fresh insight to the complex story.

The scope of this work is broader than the title suggests. It is the third volume of Professor Larkin's study of the Catholic Church in Ireland in the nineteenth century and a continuation of his earlier work *The Roman Catholic Church and the Creation of the Modern Irish State 1878–1886*. This present volume brings the story from 1888, the date of the papal condemnation of the Plan of Campaign, to the death of Parnell in 1891. Larkin's thesis is that between 1878 and 1891 Parnell created the *de facto* modern Irish state, built on a governing consensus of the Leader, the Parliamentary Party and the Catholic bishops, a consensus which exercised a role in maintaining law and order that rivalled, and

0022-0469/81/0000-0021\$00.35 © 1981 Cambridge University Press

often superseded, that of the government of the day. So powerful was this Irish political system forged by Parnell that it successfully resisted the combined pressure of Balfour's coercion acts and the government-supported combination of landlords on the one hand and papal condemnation on the other. Larkin shows well how it survived the supreme challenge of its repudiation by Parnell himself when, in the wake of his rejection by the majority of the Party, he attempted unsuccessfully to absorb the roles of the other two components of the consensus. Indeed, Larkin believes that the system survived right into the foundation of the new Irish state. The thesis is an attractive one but it implies a continuity between the Parliamentary Party and the parties formed after the Treaty of 1921 which many scholars would reject.

In the meantime, he has shed light on that important, and insufficiently investigated, dimension of the Land War and the Home Rule agitation—the activity of the Catholic clergy. Larkin is essentially a political historian and less concerned with the Church as a religious community than with tracing the political activities of its leaders. He portrays well the disgruntlement of the bishops in the wake of the Persico visit and Pope Leo's condemnation of the Plan of Campaign. Their frustration in attempting to combine their nationalist sentiments with their loyalty to Rome left them little room for manoeuvre and meanwhile Balfour and Salisbury kept up their efforts to increase papal pressure on the Irish Church. Balfour emerges as a skilful, if not too scrupulous, politician, not above misleading both Roman authorities and the Duke of Norfolk and other Catholics who acted as his intermediaries with Rome. He achieved a fair measure of success. The bishops, however, under the able leadership of William Walsh, archbishop of Dublin and Thomas Croke, archbishop of Cashel, proved more than a match for Roman intrigues. Larkin is at his best in describing the bishops' supremely capable handling of the delicate issue of papal condemnation, their refusal to be sidetracked by Balfour's proposals on the university question and their successful efforts to reassert their active role within the 'governing

F. S. L. Lyons has shown the remarkable skill of Archbishop Walsh in restraining the reaction of the Catholic bishops when the seamy details of the divorce case became public and when Gladstone's letter to Morley appeared to dash hopes for Home Rule unless Parnell retired. Larkin elaborates the point and shows that Walsh had to resist incessant pressure not merely from his fellow bishops but from Cardinal Manning, Michael Davitt (the veteran Land Leaguer) and from members of parliament. Behind the scenes he did his utmost to persuade Parnell to retire honourably and, at the same time, attempted to shield the Church from the inevitable charge of undue interference. Larkin brings out well the key role of the bishops in fighting a holding battle against Parnell and enabling the disorganised and impoverished Party to mount an effective counter-attack against a dynamic and confident leader who controlled the party organisation, the party funds and the principal nationalist daily.

Larkin's copious and effective use of the bishops' correspondence with one another provides invaluable insight into their motives and attitudes throughout this whole period and constitutes one of the principal attractions of the work. His unusual method of citation—a 'mosaic' of quotations from this correspondence—ensures a fresh and lively narrative which his judicious commentary draws together. The citations, however, are too ample, include trivia and would benefit from pruning. Many, too, will find the unorthodox

0022-0469/81/0000-0021\$00.35 © 1981 Cambridge University Press

## JOURNAL OF ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY

system he adopts for footnotes disconcerting. There is no bibliography in this volume and no reference to the significant advances made by recent students of the period.

This work will long remain the fundamental study of the involvement of the Catholic Church in Irish politics in the closing years of Parnell's meteoric career.

MAYNOOTH COLLEGE,
NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF IRELAND

DONAL KERR

Lavigerie in Tunisia: the Interplay of Imperialist and Missionary. By J. Dean O'Donnell Jr. Pp. xvii + 300 + 2 maps. Athens: The University of Georgia Press, 1979.

\$17.

J. Dean O'Donnell's Lavigerie in Tunisia is subtitled aptly The Interplay of Imperialist and Missionary, for it is less a biography of the renowned Ralliement cardinal than a study of Church and State diplomacy within the context of national and ecclesiastical imperialism. Using Lavigerie as a focal point, O'Donnell paints a brilliant canvas of the cross-sword alliance of French colonial expansion into Sahara Africa. Put succinctly by the author, this study demonstrates 'the importance of religion in the high politics of overseas expansion'. The work is a masterpiece of academic and literary skill. O'Donnell blends biographical portrayal with all the intricacies of power politics and diplomacy. Charles Cardinal Lavigerie emerges both as a vital individual and as a symbol of the imperialist missionary so common to the period.

As a person, Lavigerie is manifested as a tireless ecclesiastical 'wheeler-dealer' driven by a dream of a vast Christian Africa under the patronage of Catholicism and the French flag. One meets Lavigerie the hypochondriac, the racist and the compulsive, but Lavigerie the administrator of charity, the leader of an anti-slavery crusade and the educational reformer are presented also. He was a consummate bureaucrat, always enslaved by details, and a devoted fund raiser as skilful as any prelate of the French Church. Above all, the reader is confronted with Lavigerie the diplomat par excellence, who finds himself at home in the halls of both the Quai d'Orsay and the Vatican. Benefiting from close ties with the reigning pontiff Leo XIII, this ambitious French cardinal's supple negotiations are traced by O'Donnell in such a way as to reveal both the skill of his diplomacy and the intricacy of church-government relations at the time. In spite of French anti-clericalism, French-Italian conflicts and opposition from important sectors of his own church, Lavigerie was able to accomplish much for his personal ambitions and his patriotic and apostolic visions. He kept anti-clerical practice out of French Africa, removed his Capuchin rivals, won a red hat, assisted in saving the Napoleonic Concordat, retained his friendship with the pope and such anti-Catholic leaders as Léon Gambetta and Jules Ferry, helped in the establishment of the French Tunisian Protectorate and expanded his power as primate of Africa. Without belabouring the issue, O'Donnell portrays convincingly that these successes grew out of the cardinal's patient and resourceful politico-ecclesiastical skills.

At the same time, the author reveals the mood of an era. Monolithic myths of Church versus State in France are revealed to be simplistic. The reader encounters the conflict between anti-clericalism and imperialism, between Catholic anti-republicanism and nationalism. Domestic enemies become colonial friends when devout laicists like Gambetta and Ferry refuse to export their

0022-0469/81/0000-0021\$00.35 © 1981 Cambridge University Press