

NABMSA Reviews

England—a time when modern conceptions of public and private performance, professional and amateur musicians, and even performance scores were not yet crystalized and were much more fluid than we have previously understood them to be.

Candace Bailey
North Carolina Central University



Jennifer Oates, *Hamish MacCunn (1868-1916): A Musical Life*. Farnham, Surrey; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2013. xvi + 270 pp. ISBN 978-0-7546-6183-2

Hamish MacCunn is best known today for his overture *The Land of the Mountain and the Flood*, which was first performed at the Crystal Palace in London on 5 October 1887. The composer's melodic gifts, warm tonal palette, and deft orchestration have assured the work's longevity. Yet, as this study highlights, MacCunn was the author of a substantial oeuvre, encompassing multiple genres and demonstrating musical imagination and skill, in which his identification with his homeland acted as a double-edged sword. Still a teenager at the premiere of the work that secured his music's lasting inclusion in the orchestral repertory, he struggled to manage his undoubted musical gifts in the years that followed. Like his contemporaries, he grappled with the tensions inherent in the London-centred musical establishment. He confirmed his deep connection to his Scottish heritage and Celticness in his early works while sharing affinities with Mendelssohn, Dvořák, Grieg, and Wagner. It is argued in this volume that although he did not fully embrace modernism, he did explore a more cosmopolitan style in his smaller-scale works.

Jennifer Oates provides the first full reappraisal of MacCunn's life and works in this carefully researched and absorbing monograph. In it she seeks to understand MacCunn's compositional career and what it reveals about British musical culture and national identity in his day. Oates draws the conclusion in the second paragraph of the introduction that MacCunn's precocious potential proved to be unsustainable. She argues that MacCunn never successfully moved beyond the first impressions he generated of his Scottish affiliation, created through explicit links to landscape and literature in his music. By page six she warns that "his career served as a cautionary tale of how not to proceed." We are guided to anticipate that MacCunn's trajectory was one limited by personality, self-made Caledonian image, errors of judgement, and an inability to keep up with the times. Oates highlights the dualities that governed his experience, including: cultivated Scottish music vs. nineteenth-century European art music; rural folk settings vs. urban audiences; Scottish nationhood vs. the union; MacCunn's London base vs. his Scottishness; and British vs. Continental music.

NABMSA Reviews

The seven main chapters are arranged largely chronologically and the short conclusion, “ ‘The Potential Saviour of Native Music’: Appraisals and Conclusion,” posits (p. 223) that MacCunn fell short in developing a “recognizably ‘British’ musical idiom,” in managing the British press, and in coping with the difficulties encountered by British musicians of the day. The chronological unfolding is deftly handled, supporting and steadily highlighting the overarching themes (for example, national identity, networking, craftsmanship, career decisions, and status). This reappraisal of MacCunn interleaves critical biography with discussions of the genesis and reception of his main compositions; a list of complete works (including, where known, opus number, title, date and manuscript location, publication, and premiere) is supplied in the appendix. Although the musical examples provided in the main narrative are generous in number, the relatively unknown works of MacCunn that are discussed in the text alone are more difficult to absorb and compare. Some of the analyses probe more deeply than others, and the exploration of the influence of Mendelssohn and Tchaikovsky on MacCunn’s late 1880s output is interesting. Throughout, Oates delivers “the punch line” upfront. In Chapter Four, for example, she focuses on MacCunn’s forays into “Scottish Opera” between 1892 and 1895. The exposition sets out the ultimately disappointing outcomes for MacCunn, stating (p. 109): “the mid-1890s present only a mixture of modest achievements and lost opportunities.” This approach to the narrative pertains throughout the book and serves to create a redoubled sense of MacCunn’s unfulfilled potential.

MacCunn married Alison Pettie, daughter of the well-connected artist John Pettie, in 1889. After MacCunn’s untimely death from throat cancer in 1916 at the age of forty-eight, his widow managed his personal documents closely in an effort to excise anything that might not reflect well on him for posterity. *This Musical Life* exploits the relatively limited primary sources at its disposal wisely—there is no personal diary, and only c. 200 letters (p. 15 fn. 53) are extant; the testimony of descendants and contemporaries is included, as are illustrations of images of MacCunn; contemporary critical opinion and profiling enriches the context. Oates’s PhD dissertation (Florida State University, 2001) on MacCunn’s first opera *Jeanie Deans* (1894; commissioned by Carl Rosa in 1889), and the doctoral studies of MacCunn’s music (by Alasdair Jamieson, Durham University, 2007) and choral music (by Jane Mallinson, University of Glasgow, 2007) respectively provide substantive secondary source material, which is subjected to close discussion and acknowledgement. Regrettably little is known about MacCunn’s finances and to what extent, in different phases of his career, these drove his decisions and undertakings.

Greenock-born, into a large and prosperous shipping family that was to fall on hard times, MacCunn moved to London to study music aged fifteen and was never again to live in Scotland. He and his father are described as Scottish nationalists and supporters of Empire who saw their country as an equal partner in the Union. MacCunn was a first-generation scholarship student at the Royal College of Music, where his attendance was piecemeal; he left before completing his studies and outspokenly rejected an associateship. His bruising

NABMSA Reviews

interaction with Hubert Parry when taking his leave of the RCM in 1887 makes for gripping reading (pp. 43-7). Parry's measured response to MacCunn's views included describing him as "rebellious" and "intractable" and the telling comment: "You made the relation of master and pupil very difficult in all hands during the latter part of your stay at the College." It is all the more surprising then to learn that, notwithstanding the immoderate tone of MacCunn's correspondence in 1887, Parry subsequently acted as a witness at his wedding.

For MacCunn and his contemporaries, the value of gaining a foreign profile through international study and/or the public performance of works was understood. Yet, as Oates emphasizes, MacCunn, whose siblings were well travelled, does not appear to have owned a passport. He never belonged to the inner circle of Parry, Mackenzie, and Stanford. Indeed, his engagement as a teacher at the Royal Academy of Music and Guildhall School of Music was limited by his apparent unreliability and he thus did not exploit one of the key routes to belonging in the musical establishment. Oates describes MacCunn's strategic error, when, in his early twenties and in need of income and poised for success, he failed to deliver his *Queen Hynde of Caledon*, the choral commission for the illustrious Norwich Festival in 1890, on time. The work eventually appeared in 1892 and was accorded a lukewarm reception—he had publicly bungled the all-important mechanism of recognition via festival commissions. Critical opinion encouraged him to move beyond his Caledonian attachments and to explore wider genres and absolute music. MacCunn also went on to undertake significant amounts of work as a conductor and teacher, but without forming enduring associations with key institutions. His progress as composer, traced here, encompassed grand and light opera, pageant, partsong, art and popular song, cantata, orchestral overture, ballade, suite, ballet, and chamber music. Opera dominated his work in the 1890s and involved complex interactions with librettists, including Joseph Bennett (*Jeanie Deans*) and the Marquis of Lorne (*Diarmid*, 1897, and *Breast of Light* [incomplete]). Rosa's touring company took *Diarmid* to the provinces, and Oates notes that from this point onward MacCunn undertook more conducting and greater advocacy on behalf of Scottish music and traditions. The 1900s saw MacCunn composing imperial and popular music, forging a colorful working association with Edward German in the West End while conducting at the Savoy Theatre, and then moving on to become conductor for Beecham's Opera Company. The potential for increased income through conducting work for these popular productions surely incentivized his involvement. Writing works including *The Wreck of the Hesperus* (1905), which played three-times-a-day at the Coliseum between August and mid-October, he showed his continued ability to adapt. From 1910 he moved into composing more intimate works and championed the work of the Dunedin Association in its efforts to establish a School of Music in Edinburgh, harbouring an unfulfilled desire to be its principal. It was not until 1927, more than a decade after MacCunn's death, that the Scottish National Academy of Music was established in Glasgow.

MacCunn was keenly aware of his upper middle-class social respectability. In Oates's book, he emerges as a man with a chip on his shoulder whose outspokenness and unreliable

NABMSA Reviews

behaviour reinforced a tendency to be unstrategic in negotiation and public matters. The abiding theme is therefore one of disappointment, notwithstanding the care with which Oates explores and demonstrates the technical and musical prowess of her subject. In my view, allowing the discussion to lead to these conclusions, rather than pre-empting them early in the narrative, would have emphasized more strongly the thread of interesting, successful work undertaken by MacCunn as composer and conductor during his career. Without doubt, this book makes an important contribution to our understanding of musical culture in Britain through its evaluation of MacCunn's career. It is to be hoped that it may now encourage the revival of some of this gifted composer's lesser-known works.

Fiona M. Palmer

Maynooth University—National University of Ireland Maynooth



Rosemary Golding, *Music and Academia in Victorian Britain*. Farnham, Surrey; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2013. xi + 259 pp. ISBN 978-1-4094-5751-0 (hbk); ISBN 9781409457527 (ebk-PDF); ISBN 9781472408297 (ebk - ePUB)

In 1769, the University of Oxford conferred the degrees of Bachelor of Music and Doctor of Music on Charles Burney, who at the age of thirty-three was an organist, teacher, and composer of moderate renown; he had not yet published *The Present State of Music in France and Italy* or the *General History of Music*. Composition was the requirement, and for his degrees Burney provided a suitably worked-out exercise. There were no lectures, courses, theses, or examinations, and residence in Oxford was not required. This is a far cry from our present conception of degree requirements, and Rosemary Golding's study takes us through the nineteenth century in pursuit of what it was felt a British university degree in music could or should be.

"What shall we do with Music?", a question posed by pamphleteer Peter Maurice in 1856, becomes the title of Golding's introduction, which draws on the idea of music as science to pull together the development of music as an academic subject in the universities of Edinburgh, Oxford, Cambridge, and London. Though embedded in the nineteenth century, the subject matter is curiously topical in our own time, when (on both sides of the Atlantic) we struggle to defend our discipline in the face of budget cuts and an environment not entirely friendly towards the arts and humanities.

Burney does not figure in Golding's account, even as background, though she came to this project through examining the papers of William Crotch, whose prodigious talents had